Rating Action: Moody's Ratings changes outlook on BSTDB to stable from negative; affirms Baa2 ratings

05 Jul 2024

London, July 05, 2024 -- Moody's Ratings (Moody's) has today changed the outlook on Black Sea Trade and Development Bank (BSTDB) to stable from negative and affirmed the Baa2 long-term issuer and senior unsecured debt ratings and the (P)Baa2 senior unsecured MTN programme rating. Concurrently, we have also affirmed the short-term issuer rating at P-3.

The change in outlook to stable reflects the resilience of BSTDB's capital position amid a challenging operating environment in the context of the Russia-Ukraine war. The capital position has been supported by BSTDB's declining leverage, resilient asset quality and asset performance. The stabilization of the outlook is also driven by the recently approved capital increase, which highlights the members' commitment to the institution despite geopolitical tensions. The capital increase supports the strategic role of the bank in the region over the longer term. Overall, the bank has been successful in responding to the challenges that the war conditions in Ukraine (Ca stable) and the international sanctions on Russia have posed to the institution.

Our affirmation of the Baa2 ratings reflects BSTDB's solid capital position, and expectation that the leverage and asset quality will remain broadly stable in the medium term amid a persistently difficult operating environment. The rating also reflects adequate liquid resources, which are sufficient to meet debt repayments due over the next 12 months even when assuming no access to external funding. While we expect funding conditions to gradually improve, BSTDB is likely to continue to generate financial resources internally and relying on new bilateral financing to service its financial obligations and finance its operations unless borrowing becomes available on more affordable terms.

RATINGS RATIONALE
RATIONALE FOR CHANGING THE OUTLOOK TO STABLE
RESILIENT CAPITAL ADEQUACY AMID CHALLENGING OPERATING ENVIRONMENT

The first driver for stabilizing the outlook is the resilience of BSTDB's capital adequacy amid the current difficult operating environment. The resilience reflects declining leverage, stable asset quality, and improving asset performance despite the challenges posed by the Russia-Ukraine war. Since the start of the war in February 2022, BSTDB has focused on consolidating its balance sheet, limiting new operations and focusing on preserving its financial strength and portfolio quality. As a result, after contracting by 12.8% in 2022, the bank's development-related assets (DRAs) declined again by 23.3% in 2023. BSTDB's leverage ratio stood at 189% at end-2023, down from 256% in 2022 and a peak of 282% in 2021.

At the onset of the conflict, BSTDB had significant exposure to both Ukraine and Russia, with both countries together accounting for over 30% of DRAs as of December 2022. BSTDB stopped lending to Russia after the start of the war and the exposure notably declined by about 60% to EUR 162 million (equivalent to 10% of DRAs) at end-2023 from EUR 401 million (19.5% of DRAs) in December 2022. The outstanding exposure to Ukraine has declined as well although remaining broadly stable as a share of the portfolio (about 12% of DRAs).

The stabilization of the outlook reflects the resilience of the asset performance in the context of the Russia-Ukraine war. The exposure to Russia has experienced issues of transactional nature due to the imposition of international sanctions, which have affected the timely receipt of payments. In the case of Ukraine, the weaker asset performance is mainly a reflection of challenges posed by the war conditions to the borrowers' credit profile. About 89% and 74% of the payments (including prepayments and sold exposure) scheduled in 2022 and up to May 2024 from Russia and Ukraine, respectively, have been received by the bank. Nevertheless, in the case of Russia, about 10% of the due payments were received but are currently held in restricted accounts.

As of end-2023, stage 3 loans - mostly from Ukraine's exposure - were about 20% lower compared with 2022 but remained broadly stable as a share of DRAs at 9.6% of DRAs. Non-performing assets (NPAs) under Moody's definition stood at 6.8% at end-2023, down from 8.2% at end-2022. According to unaudited accounts, the non-performing loans (NPLs) ratio reached 5.7% as of May 2024. While these figures exclude the payment deferrals that have been agreed on about 16% of the exposure to Ukraine, our expectation is that any deterioration in asset quality would be
contained. The performance of the rest of the portfolio has remained broadly stable.

**RECENTLY AGREED CAPITAL INCREASE INDICATES SHAREHOLDER SUPPORT FOR BANK’S STRATEGIC ROLE**

After protracted discussions among the member states, the subscription process for the capital increase was completed in May 2024. BSTDB’s subscribed capital will rise to EUR 3.1 billion from EUR 2.3 billion, as originally announced in 2021, with a paid-in portion of the newly subscribed capital of 30% (the remaining 70% is callable), in line with the bank’s current capital structure. The transfer of shares will occur on 1 January 2027, and the subscribed capital payments will be made in eight instalments over 2027 to 2034.

According to the agreement reached in May 2024, and given a special exemption for International Financial Institutions provided by the EU, Russia will participate in the capital increase, but will be required to pay by cash upfront in 2027. There had been a misalignment between internal rules due to Russia’s interest in participating in the capital increase, which is protected by the bank’s statute, and the sanctions risk deriving from its participation, which led BSTDB to seek clearance from regulatory authorities in the EU. The share of Romania (Baa3 stable) and Ukraine will increase slightly given their oversubscription versus Albania (B1 positive) which does not participate.

Even though the capital increase will only materialize over the coming years, we consider it a clear sign of the commitment of the shareholders for the strategic role of the institution in a difficult geopolitical environment, and consequently improve our assessment of members’ willingness to support BSTDB. This results in an improvement of the overall strength of member support, which also captures a large amount of callable capital to total debt, balanced against the low credit quality of most of the bank’s shareholders.

**RATIONALE FOR AFFIRMING THE Baa2 RATINGS**

The affirmation of BSTDB’s ratings at Baa2 reflects our expectation that BSTDB’s capital adequacy will remain broadly stable at the current level as the bank will continue to pursue a prudent strategy given the persisting challenges posed by the Russia-Ukraine war.

While the bank will likely continue to experience asset performance pressures on its exposure to Ukraine stemming from the uncertainty related to the war, we expect NPAs to remain on an improving trend over the medium term, with any potential deterioration temporary and contained. The exposure to Russia relative to BSTDB’s overall portfolio has declined materially, and we expect that this trend will continue over time, given an
average residual maturity of the portfolio is about 3.5 years, reducing risks to asset performance.

Liquid resources are likely to decline over the next 12 months if no additional funding is secured, but we expect them to remain clearly sufficient to cover BSTDB's upcoming repayment obligations. While we expect funding conditions to gradually improve, BSTDB is likely to continue to generate financial resources internally and rely on new bilateral financing rather than tapping international capital markets, at least until borrowing becomes available on more affordable terms and the bank returns to growth.

ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL AND GOVERNANCE CONSIDERATIONS

BSTDB's credit impact score at CIS-2 reflects generally low exposure to environmental risks, low exposure to social risks, and a solid governance profile supported by a prudent framework.

The environmental issuer profile score is E-2. BSTDB's exposure to sectors affected by environmental considerations, such as the agriculture sector or sectors facing carbon transition risk, such as the oil and gas sector, is contained, with high portfolio diversification providing a mitigation.

BSTDB's social issuer profile score at S-2 reflects good customer relations and, as demonstrated until the start of Russia-Ukraine war, solid demand from its member states which are also borrowers, policies in place to safeguard responsible production, and attention to societal trends.

The governance issuer profile score at G-2 is underpinned by prudent policies and improvements in the bank's risk management framework over the past decade, which supported a robust track record of asset performance and is helping to contain asset quality risk in the current difficult operating environment in the Black Sea region. At the same time, a more fragmented shareholder base due to the geopolitical conditions can have implications for the strategic direction of the bank over time.

FACTORS THAT COULD LEAD TO AN UPGRADE OR DOWNGRADE OF THE RATINGS

Upward pressure on the rating could emerge if BSTDB's development asset credit quality materially improves and the bank manages to maintain its track record of moderate NPAs even in a continuing difficult operating environment. A significant improvement in the operating environment and in the creditworthiness of the bank's major shareholders would also be positive for the rating.

BSTDB's ratings would likely be downgraded should we conclude that a deterioration in asset quality and/or performance materially affects our
assessment of capital adequacy. Evidence of liquidity pressures and/or that access to funding sources at affordable costs has weakened on a permanent basis adversely affecting the business model, could also exert downward pressure. Any evidence that diminished cooperation between members is lastingly affecting the decision-making process of the bank, constraining its ability to meet its strategic objectives, would also be credit negative.

The principal methodology used in these ratings was Multilateral Development Banks and Other Supranational Entities published in February 2024 and available at https://ratings.moodys.com/rmc-documents/414557. Alternatively, please see the Rating Methodologies page on https://ratings.moodys.com for a copy of this methodology.

REGULATORY DISCLOSURES

For further specification of Moody's key rating assumptions and sensitivity analysis, see the sections Methodology Assumptions and Sensitivity to Assumptions in the disclosure form. Moody's Rating Symbols and Definitions can be found on https://ratings.moodys.com/rating-definitions.

For any affected securities or rated entities receiving direct credit support/credit substitution from another entity or entities subject to a credit rating action (the supporting entity), and whose ratings may change as a result of a credit rating action as to the supporting entity, the associated regulatory disclosures will relate to the supporting entity. Exceptions to this approach may be applicable in certain jurisdictions.

For ratings issued on a program, series, category/class of debt or security, certain regulatory disclosures applicable to each rating of a subsequently issued bond or note of the same series, category/class of debt, or security, or pursuant to a program for which the ratings are derived exclusively from existing ratings, in accordance with Moody's rating practices, can be found in the most recent Credit Rating Announcement related to the same class of Credit Rating.

For provisional ratings, the Credit Rating Announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the provisional rating assigned, and in relation to a definitive rating that may be assigned subsequent to the final issuance of the debt, in each case where the transaction structure and terms have not changed prior to the assignment of the definitive rating in a manner that would have affected the rating.

Moody's does not always publish a separate Credit Rating Announcement for each Credit Rating assigned in the Anticipated Ratings Process or Subsequent Ratings Process.
These ratings are solicited. Please refer to Moody's Policy for Designating and Assigning Unsolicited Credit Ratings available on its website https://ratings.moodys.com. Regulatory disclosures contained in this press release apply to the credit rating and, if applicable, the related rating outlook or rating review.

The Global Scale Credit Rating(s) discussed in this Credit Rating Announcement was(were) issued by one of Moody's affiliates outside the EU and is(are) endorsed for use in the EU in accordance with the EU CRA Regulation.

Please see https://ratings.moodys.com for any updates on changes to the lead rating analyst and to the Moody's legal entity that has issued the rating.

Please see the issuer/deal page on https://ratings.moodys.com for additional regulatory disclosures for each credit rating.

Daniela Re Fraschin
Vice President - Senior Analyst
Sovereign Risk Group
Moody's Investors Service Ltd.
One Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London, E14 5FA
United Kingdom
JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456
Client Service: 44 20 7772 5454

Dietmar Hornung
Associate Managing Director
Sovereign Risk Group
JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456
Client Service: 44 20 7772 5454

Releasing Office:
Moody's Investors Service Ltd.
One Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London, E14 5FA
United Kingdom
JOURNALISTS: 44 20 7772 5456
Client Service: 44 20 7772 5454
CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS AFFILIATES ARE THEIR CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND MATERIALS, PRODUCTS, SERVICES AND INFORMATION PUBLISHED OR OTHERWISE MADE AVAILABLE BY MOODY’S (COLLECTIVELY, “MATERIALS”) MAY INCLUDE SUCH CURRENT OPINIONS. MOODY’S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT OR IMPAIRMENT. SEE APPLICABLE MOODY’S RATING SYMBOLS AND DEFINITIONS PUBLICATION FOR INFORMATION ON THE TYPES OF CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS ADDRESSED BY MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS, NON-CREDIT ASSESSMENTS (“ASSESSMENTS”), AND OTHER OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY’S MATERIALS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY’S MATERIALS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY’S ANALYTICS, INC. AND/OR ITS AFFILIATES. MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND MATERIALS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND MATERIALS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND MATERIALS DO NOT COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR. MOODY’S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS AND OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLISHES OR OTHERWISE MAKES AVAILABLE ITS MATERIALS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.

MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS, AND MATERIALS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS.
AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS AND INAPPROPRIATE FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO USE MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS OR MATERIALS WHEN MAKING AN INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY’S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT. FOR CLARITY, NO INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN MAY BE USED TO DEVELOP, IMPROVE, TRAIN OR RETRAIN ANY SOFTWARE PROGRAM OR DATABASE, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, FOR ANY ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE, MACHINE LEARNING OR NATURAL LANGUAGE PROCESSING SOFTWARE, ALGORITHM, METHODOLOGY AND/OR MODEL.

MOODY’S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND MATERIALS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY ANY PERSON AS A BENCHMARK AS THAT TERM IS DEFINED FOR REGULATORY PURPOSES AND MUST NOT BE USED IN ANY WAY THAT COULD RESULT IN THEM BEING CONSIDERED A BENCHMARK.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY’S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided “AS IS” without warranty of any kind. MOODY’S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY’S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY’S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the credit rating process or in preparing its Materials.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY’S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY’S or any of its directors, officers, employees,
agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY’S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY’S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY’S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY CREDIT RATING, ASSESSMENT, OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY’S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody’s Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody’s Corporation (“MCO”), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody’s Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any credit rating, agreed to pay to Moody’s Investors Service, Inc. for credit ratings opinions and services rendered by it. MCO and Moody’s Investors Service also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of Moody’s Investors Service credit ratings and credit rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold credit ratings from Moody’s Investors Service, Inc. and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at www.moodys.com under the heading “Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Charter Documents - Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy.”

Moody’s SF Japan K.K., Moody’s Local AR Agente de Calificación de Riesgo S.A., Moody’s Local BR Agência de Classificação de Risco LTDA, Moody’s Local MX S.A. de C.V, I.C.V., Moody’s Local PE Clasificadora de Riesgo S.A., and Moody’s Local PA Calificadora de Riesgo S.A.
(collectively, the “Moody’s Non-NRSRO CRAs”) are all indirectly wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiaries of MCO. None of the Moody’s Non-NRSRO CRAs is a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization.

Additional terms for Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY’S affiliate, Moody’s Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody’s Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to “wholesale clients” within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY’S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a “wholesale client” and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to “retail clients” within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY’S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail investors.

Additional terms for India only: Moody’s credit ratings, Assessments, other opinions and Materials are not intended to be and shall not be relied upon or used by any users located in India in relation to securities listed or proposed to be listed on Indian stock exchanges.

Additional terms with respect to Second Party Opinions (as defined in Moody’s Investors Service Rating Symbols and Definitions): Please note that a Second Party Opinion (“SPO”) is not a “credit rating”. The issuance of SPOs is not a regulated activity in many jurisdictions, including Singapore. JAPAN: In Japan, development and provision of SPOs fall under the category of “Ancillary Businesses”, not “Credit Rating Business”, and are not subject to the regulations applicable to “Credit Rating Business” under the Financial Instruments and Exchange Act of Japan and its relevant regulation. PRC: Any SPO: (1) does not constitute a PRC Green Bond Assessment as defined under any relevant PRC laws or regulations; (2) cannot be included in any registration statement, offering circular, prospectus or any other documents submitted to the PRC regulatory authorities or otherwise used to satisfy any PRC regulatory disclosure requirement; and (3) cannot be used within the PRC for any regulatory purpose or for any other purpose which is not permitted under relevant PRC laws or regulations. For the purposes of this disclaimer, “PRC” refers to the mainland of the People’s Republic of China, excluding Hong Kong, Macau and Taiwan.